

**Editing of and Commentary on a Verse of Hafez' Divan  
Based on Intertextuality and Rhetorics  
Hilat, Hâlat or Tâqat?**

**M. Jafarian**

PHD of Persian Language & Literature

**M. Mousazadeh**

Assistant Professor of Persian Language & Literature,  
Tabriz University

**In this verse of Hafez:**

*Kuh-e anduh-e ferâqat be çe hilat bekešad*

*Hâfez-e xaste ke az nâle tan-aš çon nâl-i-st*

there are three recordings: *Hilat/Hâlat/Tâqat* and there is disagreement among the editors of Hafez' Divan over them. Choosing any of these three recordings is valid from the lexical point of view, but only one of them can be the Hafez' final selection. *Hilat* in addition to its known common meaning "*ploy, stratagem*", beside *xaste* "injured, diseased" refers to another meaning: "medicine". Furthermore, what strengthens the status of *Hilat* is its relation to ancient mechanical engineering term. The word *bekešad* in this verse strengthens this hypothesis, which due to translation, corresponds to *Jarr* "lifting" in the *Ilm-u Jarr al-Aθqâl* "science of lifting weights". In the scientific tradition of the islamic Middle Ages, the *Ilm al-Hiyal* "the science of devices", covers the whole tradition of Islamic practical mechanics, in contrast to theoretical

mechanics represented by the *Ilm al-Aḥqâl / Jarr al-Aḥqâl* “the science of (lifting) weights”.

**However, the other two recordings:**

*Hâlat* and *Tâqat* are not completely unreasonable; the texts that Hafez was influenced by, can be a reason for the relative acceptability of the recording of *Tâqat*. From the homonymy and amphibology point of view *Hâlat* has also a special meaning, which has been less noticed by the commentators and editors of Hafez’ Divan; These figures of speech are based on the manuscripts’ styles of writing, which the writers and poets of the past - at least in a certain period - paid full attention to. This article seeks to examine the reasons for the relative acceptability of the two other recordings, and examine the preference of the *Hilat* from textual and rhetorical point of view as the final recording of Hafez.

**Research method, background and purpose:**

Paying attention to the recording of manuscripts (=the date/multiplicity/importance of the manuscripts) is a necessary condition for any scientific-critical correction. However, this criterion is not absolutely decisive in preferring one recording over another. The correction of any recording, in addition to relying on the recording of manuscripts, must be based on research/textual research/text documents and also rely on rhetorical principles. In other words, besides paying attention to the recording of manuscripts, rhetorical and textual meanings are also useful and open the way. For example, in the verse:

*Kuh-e anduh-e ferâqat be çe hilat bekešad*

*Hâfez-e xaste ke az nâle tan-aš čon nâl-i-st*

According to the book of variations of Hafez' ghazals (based on fifty manuscripts of the 9th century), the recording of the phrase *be če hâlat* has been reported in three ways: *be če hâlat* / *be če hilat* / *be če tâqat*. Each of these three forms is justified and the manuscripts that support them are also worthy of consideration. In this situation, the corrector may mechanically take the side of the majority and the oldest of the manuscripts and choose the recording *be če hilat* and maybe he/she is right in this choice; but there are reasons and evidences that this method, at least in the correction of Hafez' Divan is not always correct, and in some cases, it leads to the preference of an unfavorable form. Another corrector may choose the recording of *be če hâlat* according to the importance, authenticity and validity of the 827 AH manuscript (Xalxâli), and also the recording of *be če tâqat* may also be preferred by the corrector with the help of some evidence. Now the question arises, who is right in the meantime?

In this essay, while paying attention to the state of the manuscripts, we have tried to choose the appropriate form through searching in the common texts of Hafez' era and also a relative knowledge of Hafez' rhetoric.

**Discussion and review:**

Regarding the verse *Kuh-e anduh-e ferâqat be če hâlat bekešad/ Hâfez-e xaste ke az nâle tan-aš čon nâl-i-st*, the recording *be če tâqat* is documented to a written manuscript between 813 and 834 AH and an undated one from the 9th century. Although the manuscript support of

this recording is not reassuring, this issue alone cannot be the main reason for the refusal of this recording. Rather, as it was discussed, despite the possibility of Hafez being influenced by previous texts, and in other words, having textual documentation, in addition to the weakness of the manuscript support, in terms of rhetorical tricks, this recording has less priority and importance compared to the other two recordings and despite being flawless, it does not match Hafez' rhetoric. In the meantime, *be çe hâlat* has a special status. This recording is documented both in terms of the manuscript support of the 827 A.H, which is a reliable manuscript, and it also has a feature and rhetorical detail that we mentioned as *spelling amphibology*, and it is not unlikely that, considering Hafez' interest to amphibology, before *be çe hilat*, which in our opinion is the final recording of Hafez, has attracted Hafez' attention and show a period of the aesthetics of his poetry; this is the amphibology that has not been paid much attention before.

### **Conclusion:**

In the end, we consider *be çe hilat* to be the final form among the three mentioned recordings and, of course, the most appropriate one with Hafez' rhetoric, for the following reasons: First, this recording has a strong manuscript support compared to the other two. Secondly, there are significant textual documentations in works such as *Tabaqât al-Sufiyyah*, *Kimiyâye Sa'âdat*, *Axlâq-e Nâseri*, *Qâbusnâme* and *Kaşf al-Asrâr*, which use *hilat* in the meaning of "medicine", and according to the influence of Hafez from the texts before him, the poet by using this word in addition to *xaste* (= the patient) has created amphibology.

We see the same amphibology about the verb to *kešidan* “to pull” with *hilat* (which conjures up to the mind the meaning *Jarr al-Aθqâl* “the science of lifting weights” and *Ilm al-Hiyal* “the science of devices”, which were two practical and theoretical branches of ancient mechanics, and today and in modern sciences, they are discussed under the title of mechanical engineering science). This is the discussion which Hamidiyân has mentioned earlier - of course, with doubts- but the authors believe that in this regard, it is possible to go beyond the possibility of the reference to the *Ilm al-Hiyal* and *Jarr al-Aθqâl* and consider it almost certain, and the recording *hilat* is the final and preferred recording of Hafez in this verse.

The last point regarding the superiority of the *hilat* over the other two recordings is that due to the proximity of the word *kuh* “mountain” to *hilat*. We did not think it unlikely that due to Hafez’ mastery of the Arabic language, he had an opinion on *haylah* which Dehxodâ quoting Aqrab al-Mawâred has recorded the meaning “stones that fall down from around and on the sides of the mountain and become many” for it. The result is that we believe that, along with the stronger support of manuscripts, all the above reasons confirm the preference of *hilat*.

Keywords: Hafez, Divan; Critical Edition; Hilat; Hâlat; Tâqat.

**References:**

- AL-Quranu'l-Karim. Tarjomeh: Bahaa'o'd-Din Xorram-Shaahi. Tehraan: Dustan. 1386
- Aashuri, D. (1381). Erfan va Rendi dar Sh'r-e Haafiz. Tehraan: Markaz
- Ibn Al-Nadim, M. (?). Al-Fihrist. Beirut: Daar-ol M'arifah

- Ansaari Hiravi, A. (1341). Tabaghaat-ol Sufiyeh. Tashih: Habibi. ? : ?
- Este'laami, M. (1388). Dars-e Haafiz. Tehraan: Soxan
- Jahaanbaxsh, J. (1390). Rahnamaa-ye Tashih-e Motun. Tehraan: Mitraa
- Haafiz, Sh. (1390). Haafiz be Sa'ye sayeh. Tehraan: Karnaameh
- Haafiz, Sh. (1388). Divaan. Tehraan: Soxan
- Haafiz, Sh. (1387). Divaan. Tashih: Qazvini va Qani. Kushesh: Jorbozeh-daar. TEhraan: Asaatir
- Haafiz, Sh. (1385). Divaan. Tashih: Eyvazi. Tehraan: Amir Kabir
- Haafiz, Sh. (1378). Divaan. Qaraa'at-Goziniye Intiqadi. Kushesh: Jaavid va Xorram-Shaahi. Tehraan. Farzaan Ruz
- Haafiz, Sh. (1375). Divaan. Tashih: Xaanlari. 2 Jild. Tehraan: Xaarazmi
- Haafiz, Sh. (1372). Divaan. Tashih: Jalali Na'ini va Nuraani Visaal. Tehraan: Soxan / Noqreh
- Hamidiaan, S. (1395). Sharhe-Showq. 5 Jild. Tehraan: Qatreh
- Dehxoda, A. ( ? ). Loqatnaameh [CD-ROM]. Tehraan: Daneshgahe-Tehraan
- Zarrinkub, A. (1389). Kaarnaame-ye Islam. Tehraan: Amirkabir
- Sudi, M. (1395). Sharh-e Ghazalha-ye Hafiz. Tarjomeh: Sattarzadeh. Tehraan: Neghaah
- Shafi'iye-Kadkani, M. (1397). In Kimiaye-Hasti. 3 Jild. Tehraan: Soxan
- Shamisaa, S. (1383). Negahi Taaze be Badi'. Tehraan: Mitraa
- Tusi, N. (1346). Akhlaagh-e Naaseri. Tashih: Adib Tehraani. ? : Jaavidaan
- Eyvazi, R. (1384). Haafize-Bartar Kodaam Ast?. Tehraan: Amir Kabir

- Ghazali, M. (1381). *Kimia-ye Sa'adat*. Tashih: Aaraam. Tehraan: Ganjineh
  - Firdowsi, A. (1398). *Shaahnameh*. Tashih: Xaaleqiye-Motlaq. 4 Jild. Tehraan: Soxan
  - Qaabus, O. (1371). *Qaabusnaameh*. Tashih: Yusofi. Tehraan: Elmi va Farhangi
  - Mortazavi, M. (1388). *Maktabe-Haafiz*. 2 Jild. Tehraan: Tus
  - Meybodi, R. (1361). *Kashfu'l-Asraar va Oddatu'l-Abraar*. Tashih: Hekmat. 10 Jild. Tehraan: Amir Kabir
  - Nasr, H. (1393). *Ilm va Tamddon dar islaam*. Tarjomeh: Aaraam. Tehraan: Elmi va Farhangi
  - Neysaari, S. (1385). *Daftare-Degarsaaniha dar Qazalhaaye-Haafiz*. 2 Jild. Tehraan: Farhangestaane-
  - Vassaaf-ol Hazreh, Sh. (711 Hijr1388). *Taarix-e Vassaaf-ol Hazreh*. Tashih: Haajiannezhaad. J 4. Tehran: Daneshgah-e Tehraan
  - Heravi, H. (1392). *Sharh-e Gazalha-ye Haafiz*. 4J. Tehraan: Nashr-e Now
  - Yahaghi, M. (1372). *Farhangname-ye Quraani*. Mash'had: Astan-e Quds-e Razavi
- Articles:
- Ma'sumi, H. (1381). *Jaam-e Adl / Ta'ammoli dar Ma'naa-ye Beiti az Haafiz*. Dar Nashr-e Daanesh. Shomaare-ye 103. Safheh: 18-30
- Manuscripts:
- Haafiz, Sh. (1375). *Divaan*. Kohantarin Nosxeye-ShenaaxteShodeye-Kamel. Ketaabat: 801 Hijri. DastNevis-e-Shomaareh: 5194 Ketaabxaaneyeye-Nur Osmaaniyeye-Estaanbul. NosxeBargardaan. Kushesh: Imani. Tehraan: Mirase-Maktub

- Vassaaf-ol Hazreh, Sh. (711 Hijri). Taarix-e Vassaaf-ol Hazreh. Be Khatt-e Mo'allef. J 4. Microfilm-e Shomaare-ye 2819. Ketabkhaane-ye Markazi va Asnaad-e Daneshgah-e Tehraan