

An Analysis of the Accuracy of Attribution of Divane Khatayi to Shah Isma'il I of Safavid Based on Gerard Genette's Theory

Ebrahim Danesh

Assistant professor, Department of of Persian Language & Literature,
University of Mohaghegh Ardabili (Corresponding author)

Sajjad Hoseini

Associate professor, Department of history & Sociology, University of
Mohaghegh Ardabili, Ardabil, Iran.

Introduction

Some reliable historical and literary sources prove that Shah Isma'il I of Safavid, had a poetic talent and there are some Persian and Turkish poetry along with a book named Divane Khatayi attributed to him. But this attribution has some opponents and proponents:

- Some have generally doubted the attribution of the Divane Khatayi to him.
- Some believe that he sometimes wrote poetry, but do not accept the attribution of a poetic divan including sonnets, odes, quatrains, etc. to him.
- A group also believes that the majority of Divane Khatayi's poems are his, but some poems have entered into his divan manuscripts for various reasons.

Methods and Results

This paper has been conducted in a descriptive-analytical way, based on Gerard Genette's paratextuality referring to the reliable historical and literary sources of the Safavid era, especially Divane Khatayi, and concluded that numerous internal and external paratexts prove the attribution of the Divane Khatayi to Shah Isma'il I of Safavid. The author of "Shah Isma'il Khatayi" validated the attribution of the Divane Khatayi to him and criticized the researchers that consider the Safavid era as the course of the decadence of literature (See. Arasli, 1346: 40-50). The author of "Secrets in the Heart of History" and "The Rumors of Shah Isma'il's poesy" rejected it for a variety of reasons (See. Mansouri, 1997: 46-83; Mansouri, 2004: 49). This research investigates Divane Khatayi as focal text and its internal and external paratexts in order to analyze the accuracy of its attribution to Shah Isma'il I of Safavid.

Discussion

Gerard Genette, one of the most remarkable theorists in text studies applied the term transtextuality to the various relations of a text with others. He divided transtextual relations into five categories named "intertextuality", "architextuality", "metatextuality", "hypertextuality", and "paratextuality" (See. Namvare Motlaq, 2007: 83). On the contrary to other types of transtextuality, paratextuality peruses the study of the relations of a text with its connected or disconnected paratexts that have organic and complementary relation with it (See. Salimie Kouchi, 2017: 250). Paratexts are gateways to the world of text and factors to understand it thoroughly because "they highlight the neglected parts of

the text and Reveal its literary and historical value and in this way, they solve many problems and uncertainties about it” (Pirani, 2017: 169). Genette divides paratexts into two main kinds i.e. internal (connected) and external (disconnected):

- Internal paratexts are directly related to focal text and one can't get a full understanding of the text without them. They are divided into three categories: publisher paratexts, author paratexts, and paratexts of others.
- External paratexts are indirectly associated with focal text and allow it to be promoted or criticized. They are divided into two categories namely publisher and author paratexts, and paratexts of others.

Paratextual evidence of doubt in attributing the Divane Khatayi to Shah Isma'il I are:

- Some of the poems entered into Divane Khatayi are in fact in the eulogy of Shah Isma'il I, not his poems.
- There were other poets with the Pen name of “Khatayi” In periods close to Shah Isma'il I, that Some of their poems are probably attributed to Shah Isma'il (Kuşca, 2014: 86).

The author of "Scientists of Azerbaijan" believes that “there was another Khatayi in periods close to Shah Isma'il I that wrote a poem named “Yousef and Zoleikha” in honor of Soltan Ya'gub in Turkish”(Tarbiat, 1998: 219). On the contrary, Sa'doddin Nozhat Argun rejected the existence of other poets in Khatayi pen name. He claimed to have examined all Ottoman Tazkira al-Sho'aras and had not found another poet in the Khatayi pen name (Ergün, 1878: 24,25). Some people also have doubted the poesy of Shah Isma'il I, and the attribution

of Divane Khatayi to him for a variety of reasons (See. Mansouri, 1997: 46-83). His book and claims can be criticized in the following respects:

- Attributing all of Shah Isma'il's poetry to Baktashiyeh.
- Claiming that Haydar in this poetry refers to sultan Haydar the son of Ahmad Yasavi rather than sheikh Haydar, Shah Isma'il I's father.
- Ignoring the report of Safavid sources about Shah Isma'il I's poetry. Being surprised at Shah Isma'il's praise and devotion to someone titled "King" regardless of the fact that he means the "king of believers", "Imam Ali".
- Some scholars point to the paucity of Shah Isma'il I's poetry in Tazkiras regarding it as the reason for rejecting his poesy, Regardless of the fact that in Tazkiras, only some examples of poems are mentioned.

-

Conclusion

Examining Divane Khatayi's external and internal paratexts based on Gerard Genett's transtextuality theory and referring to reliable historical and literary sources, etc. show that its attribution to Shah Isma'il I has a strong scientific, literary and historical backing. Most of the authors of Tazkiras and historical books proved Shah Isma'il I's poesy as the owner of Divane Khatayi and Khatayi pen name since the Safavid era. Some of the poems in Divane Khatayi are very weak and only have exciting emotions to motivate Sufis and Qizilbashes and it is consistent with the spiritual and literary conditions of Shah Isma'il I. Most of the internal paratexts of Divane Khatayi are "the title of the divan" and "the poet's pen name" in addition to indicating both to a single person, they

have come together frequently in high frequency proves the accuracy of the attribution of Divane Khatayi to Shah Isma'il I. Also, the most external paratexts are the reports of the authors of Tazkiras about his poesy and poetry and attribution of Divane Khatayi to him along with offering examples of his poems that show the place of Divane Khatayi and his author in the literature of Iran, Turkey, and Azerbaijan and proves the accuracy of Divane Khatayi's attribution to the founder of Safavid dynasty. Other paratexts are reports of Ashigs, the authors of historical books, dictionaries, encyclopedias, lineages, travelogues, etc.

Keywords: Divane Khatayi, Shah Isma'il I, Gerard Genette, paratextual evidences.

Resources

Abd ol-Razzaq Samarqandi, Kama ol-Din. (2004). *Matla'i Sa'dain va Majma'i Bahrain*. By Abd ol-Hosein Nava'i: Tehran, Institute for Humanities and Cultural Studies.

Al-Bourini, Hasan. (1963). *Tarajim ol-A'yan Min Abna el-Zaman*. V2, Salah al-Din al-Munjid, Damascus: Al-Majma' ol-'Elmi el-Arabi press.

Alishire Nava'i, Amir Nizam Ol-Din. (1984). *Majalis ol-Nafa'is*. By Ali Asaghr Hekmat, Tehran: Manouchehri Library.

Allen, Graham. (2006). *Roland Barthes*. Translated by Payam Yazdanjou, Tehran: Markaz.

Al-Tehrani, Aqa Bozorg. (n.d.). *Al-zhari'a ila, Tasanif el-Shi'a*. Beirut: Dar ol-Azwa'.

Arabzadeh, Abolfazl. (1999). *List of Manuscripts of Ayatollah Golpayegani Public Library*. Qom: Dar ol-Qaran el-Karim.

Arasli, Hamid. (1946). *Shah Isma'il Khatayi*. Baku: Journal of Civil Society of Iran and Azarbaijan.

Azar Bigdeli, Lotfalibeig. (1957). *Atashkadayi Azar*. V1, Edited by Hasan Sadate Naseri, Tehran: Amir Kabir.

Bagheri, Mehri. (2010). *Basics of Linguistics*, Tehran: Qatre.

Bahari Sistani, Malek Shah Hosein. (2018). *Tazkiraye Khair ol-Bayan*. Edited by Abdolali Oveisi Kehkha, Zahedan: University of Sistan and Baluchestan.

Bakikhanof, Abbasqoli Agha. (2003). *Golestani Eram*. Tehran: Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Banani, Amin et al. (2001). *Safavids*. Translated and Edited by Ya'ghoub Ajand, Tehran: Maula.

Barbaro, Giosafa et al. (1970). *Venetian Travelogues in Iran*. Translated by Manouchehr Amiri, Tehran: Kharazmi.

Chardin, Jean. (1966). *Chardin Travelogue*. V7, Translated by Mohammad Abbasi, Tehran: Amirkabir.

Dad, Sima. (2003). *A dictionary of literary terms*. Tehran: Morward.

Eagleton, Terry. (2001). *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, Translated by Abbas Mokhber, Tehran: Mrakaz.

Ebadi Qarakhanlou, Mohammad. (2014). *Ashiq Qorbani She'rlar*. Tabriz: Akhtar.

(2014). *Khasta Qasim*, Tabriz: Akhtar.

Ergun, S. N. (1978) *Divane Khatayi: Shah Isma'il of Safavid's Life and Poetry*, Istanbul: Ma'arif Press.

Esmaeilzadeyi Douzal, Rasoul. (2009). *Shah Isma'il of the Safavid*. Tehran: Al-Huda.

- Espanaqchi Pashazade, Mohammad. (2000). *Enqelab ol-Islam Bayn alKhavasse val-Avamm*. By Rsoul Ja'farian, Qom: Dalil.
- Fakhri Hiravi. (1966). *Rawzat ol-Salatin*. Edited by Abdol -Rasoul Khayyampour, Tabriz: Institute of Iranian History and Culture.
- Gharibi, Montsha Oghlu. (2003). *Divan and Tazkira of Rom Poets*. Edited by of Hosein Mohammadzade Seddiq, Tehran: Editor.
- Ghazvini, Abolhasan. (1988). *Favayid ol-Safsviyya*. Edited by Maryam Mirahmadi, Tehran: Institute for Cultural Studies and Research.
- Hafizi Abru, Abdullah. (2001). *Zobdat ol-Tawarikh*. V2, Edited by Sayyid Kamal Haj Sayyid Javadi, Tehran: Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance.
- Haji Khalifa, Mustafa. (1941). *Kashf ol-Zonun*. Edited by Sharf al-DIn Yaltkaya, Istanbul: Ma'arif Press.
- Headayat, Reza Qolikhan. (1957). *Majma' ol-Fosaha*. By Mazahir Musaffa, Tehran: Amirkabir.
- Hoseini, Mohammad Bagher. (2016). "The possibility of denomination the Qur'an into "text" based on a new definition in literary criticism theories. *Biannual Journal of Ketab-e-Gayyem*, Issue 6, No14, pp. 89-111.
- Hujviri, 'Ali b. 'Uthman. (2002). *Kashf ol-Mahjoub*. Edited by Valentin Zhukofsky, Tehran: Tahuri.
- Karimiane Sichani, Mahdi and Abdollahi Taromsari, Zahra. (2009). "Introducing a series of manuscripts in Turkish of the Library of the Islamic Consultative Assembly." *Journal of Payame Baharestan*, D. 2, Issue. 1, No. 4.

khandmir, Ghiasol-Din. (2001). *The History of Habib ol-Seyar fi Akhbari Afradi Bashar*. Supervised by Mohammad Dabirsiyaqi, Tehran: Khayyam.

Khatayi, Shah Isma'il. (1966). *Shah Isma'il Khatayi's works*. Edited by Hamid Arasli, Baku: Journal of Azarbaijan. S. S. Sciences Academy.

_____. (2009). *Collection of Shah Isma'il Safavi's Poems*. Edited by of Rasoul Esmailzadeye Douzal, Tehran: Al-Huda.

_____. (n.d.). *Divane Khatayi*. Manuscript, Library of the Islamic Consultative Assembly.

Kitabdar, Sadeghi Beigh. (1948). *Majma'ol-Khavass*. Translated by Abd ol-Rasoul Khayyampour, Tabriz: Akhtar.

Kushja, S. (2014). *Mystic Elements of Shah Isma'il and Pir sultan Abdal's poetry* (B. A Thesis). Eskishahir Osmangazi University.

Latifi Kastamounili, Abd ol-Latif. (1935). *Tazkiraye Latifi*. By Ahmed Judat, Istanbul: Eqdam.

Mansouri, Firouz. (1977). *Secrets in the Heart of History*. Tehran: Author.

_____. (2004). "The Rumor of Shah Isma'il Safavi's Poesy." *Journal of Hafiz*, No. 2.

Mashkour, Mohammad Javad. (1970). *A View on Azarbaijan History and its Antiquities and Demographics*. Tehran: National works Association.

MirJa'fari, Hosein. (2005). "Shah Isma'il's lovers in Anatolia." *Collected papers of the conference of Safavids on the History of Iran*, by of Ali Sadeqi, Tabriz: Sotoude.

- Mo'in, Mohammad. (2007). *Persian Dictionary*. V1. Tehran: Adena.
- Modarris Tabrizi, Mirza Mohammad Ali. (2013). *Rayhanat ol-Adab*. Qom: Ayyatollah Mar'ashi Najafi Library.
- Namvare Motlaq, Bahman. (2007). "Transtextuality: The study of the relationship between a text and other texts." *Research Journal of Humanities*, No. 56, pp. 2004-2014.
- Peck, J. & Coyle M. (2002). *Literary Terms and Criticism*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Pirani, Mansour. (2016). "Treshold Texts in Relation to Comparative Literature (Case Study Sa'diname)", *Quarterly Journal of Comparative Literature Research*, Issue 4, No 3, pp. 167-197.
- Pirzade Abdale Zahidi, Hosein. (2016). *Linage of Safavids*. Edited by Hosein Nasir Baghban, Tehran: Armaghane Tarikh.
- Rawzatian, Sayyida Mariam, and Mirbaqerifard, Sayyid Ali Asghar. (2011). "Intertextual Reading, Better Reception of Mystical Texts". *Quarterly Journal of Kavoshnameh in Persian Language and Literature*, Issue 12, No. 23, pp. 89-112.
- Rawzatian, Sayyida Mariam. (2011). "Tazkirat ol-Awliya's attachments (intertextual study and comparison of the first and second part of Tazkirat ol-Awliya)." *Persian Language and Literature Research Journal (Gohare Gooya)*, Issue 5, No. 1, pp. 147-174.
- Roumlu, Hasan Beig. (1963). *Ahsan ol-Tavarikh*. By Charles Narman Siden, Tehran: Shams Library.
- Roymer, Hans Robert. (2001). *Iran on the way to a new era*. Translated by Azar Ahanchi, Tehran: University of Tehran.
- Safavi, Sam Mirza. (2005). *Tazkirayi Tohfayi Sami*. Edited by Rokn ol-Din Homayounfarrokh, Tehran: Asatir.

Salimi Kouchi, Ibrahim. (2017). "The role of paratextual elements in the development of Mathnavi's understanding." *Quarterly Journal of Research in Contemporary World Literature*, Issue 22, No. 1, pp. 249-268.

Sami, Shams ol-Ddin. (1929). *Qamoos ol-A'lam*. V3, Istanbul: Mehran.

Sasani, Farhad. (2005). "The Effect of Intertextual Relationships in Text Reading", *Journal of Language and Linguistics*, Issue 1, NO. 2, pp. 39-54.

Shami, Nizam ol-Din. (1984). *Zafarnameh*. By Panahi Semnani, Tehran: Book Publishing Organization.

Sultan ol-Qura'i, Mohammad Amin. (2016). "Introducing the unique manuscript of Shah Isma'il Safavi Khatayi's Collection in the Library of Allameh Ja'far Sultan al-Qura'i." *Journal of Payam Baharestan*, Issue 9, No. 28, pp. 47-59.

Tarbiat, Mohammad Ali. (1994). *Rejale Azarbaijan*. By Gholamreza Tabataba'ie Majd, Tabriz: Negar.

_____. (1998). *Azarbaijan scientists*. By Gholamreza Tabataba'ie Majd, Tehran: Ministry of Culture and Islamic Guidance.

Turkaman, Eskandar Beig. (1955). *Alam Araye Abbasi History*. V1, Tehran: Amirkabir.

Valaye Daghestani, AliQoli. (2005). *Tazkiraye Riaz ol-Sho'ara*. V2, Edited by of Sayyid Mohsen Naji Nasrabadi, Tehran: Asatir.

Yazdi, Sharaf ol-Din Ali. (2008). *Zafarname*. Edited by Sayyid Sa'id Mirza Mohammad Sadeq and Abd ol-Hosein Nava'i, V1, Tehran: Library, Museum and Documentation Center of the Islamic Consultative Assembly.

Zafar Ardabili, Mortaza Qoli. (2009). *Divan of Turkish Poems Morteza Qoli Zafar Ardabili*. Edited by Hosein Mohammadzade Seddiq, Ardabil: Sheikh Safi ol-Din.