



**A Critical Reflection on Habib Yaghmaei's Edition of Asadi Toossi's
*Garshasbnamah***

Ali Afrakhteh 

PhD student of Persian Language and Literature,
Yasuj University, Yasuj, Iran

Yousof Nikrouz (Corresponding Author) 

Assistant Professor of Persian Language and Literature,
Yasouj University, ynikrouz@yu.ac.ir

Ali Asghar Ghafouri 

Assistant Professor of Persian Language and Literature,
Yasuj University, Yasuj, Iran

Alireza Shanzazri 

Assistant Professor of Persian Language and Literature,
Yasuj University, Yasuj, Iran

Introduction

In the critical edition, the researcher tries to use the most suitable method to compare the available manuscripts of a literary work and provide a printed version of it that is closest to the author's original manuscript in terms of both wording and meaning. In 1938, Asadi Tousi's *Garshasbnameh* was edited and published completely for the first time with the efforts of Habib Yaghmai. The authors of the present article have found shortcomings and inadequacies in this edition after a critical and group review of *Garshasbnameh*. These problems are not limited to the verses that Yaghmai highlighted with a mark (?); rather, there are many other verses in this edition that are confusing and incomprehensible. Therefore, it is necessary to share some of them with the experts to open the way for the future related research.

DOI: [10.22099/JBA.2024.49706.4516](https://doi.org/10.22099/JBA.2024.49706.4516)



COPYRIGHTS ©2021 The author(s). This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY-NC 4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, as long as the original authors and source are cited. No permission is required from the authors or the publisher.



Received: 2024-04-09

Accepted: 2024-05-25

Methodology, Review Literature, and Purpose

The most complete edition of *Garshasbnameh* so far is undertaken by Yaghmai. Of course, before him, several people had published excerpts from *Garshasbnameh*. Reza Qoli Khan Hedayat included 5600 lines from *Garshasbnameh* in his *Majma ol-Fosaha's Tazkira*. Rashid Yasemi also published a selection under the title *Asadi Toosi's Andarznameh*. Clement Imbaut Huart intended to edit and publish a complete version of *Garshasbnameh*, but he published only 5086 lines when his life ended. Moreover, Mirza Mohammad Malik ol-Kottab published a lithograph of excerpts from *Garshasbnameh* in Mumbai, India, in 1928, two copies of which are kept in the National Library of Iran, Nos. 9159 and 8808. Several essays have been published about *Garshasabnameh*; however, none has been about Yaghmaei's edition of *Garshasabnameh* so far.

The writers of this research, using documentary and library methods, seek to compare the manuscripts that Yaghmai used for editing *Garshasabnameh*, and by citing examples, criticize Yaghmai's editing methods and its final form.

Discussion

These are the problems of Yaghmai's edition:

1. From among the nine manuscripts he had in hand, Yaghmai excluded two manuscripts (Majlis and Forouzanfar) from the edition process and rarely used two others (Esfandiari and National Library). This is while the mentioned manuscripts have the only or the most correct records in some places.

For example, the phrase "نز دوزخ اهریمن است" (recorded by Sepehsalar, Majlis, Astana-ya Razaviya, and London Museum) is included in the text, which weakens the semantic and logical relation of the verses. The National Library manuscript has the phrase "اگر خود ز اهریمن است" instead of this, which clearly reflects the message of the text, which is to blame the soldiers:

بُهو گفت: «اگر خود ز اهریمن است،

هزارید و او یک تن است شما صد

3 Journal of Poetry Studies

2. The editor sometimes adds a textual variant to the text and the copy-text to the margin without specifying in the margin (deviation from the multicopy-text method). Sometimes, he adds a word to the text that is not found in any manuscript, and in the margin, he does not specify comparative editing (deviation from comparative editing). He derived the following lines from the London Museum manuscript, but he did not give an explanation in this regard, nor did he mention the copy-text record:

سپه را چنین پنج ره بازگاشت
به صد چاره بر جایگهشان بداشت

The word "چنان" in the following lines is not found in any manuscript, and there is no note indicating comparative editing in the margin:

چنانیم ما پیششان روز کین
چنان چشمه در پیش دریای چین

3. In some cases, the copy-text record is wrong or weak in comparison with the substitutes; but it remains in the text. For example, the word "دگر" in the following lines should be replaced with the word "اگر" (the London Museum manuscript record) to preserve the logical and semantic relation of the verses:

گزارم چو فرمان دهد پهلوان
دگر کس نداند جز از ترجمان

In some cases, a textual variants record (بگذاشتن) is brought into the text, while the copy-text record (بگذاشتش) is more correct.

چنان زدش بر سر که شد سرنشیب
سر و ترگ بگذاشتن تا رکیب

4. The mentioned edition is not only carelessly typed, but also not edited it in subsequent publications. For example, the wrong spelling of the verbs "بِتَفَت" and "بِکَفَت" in the following lines:

ز تیغش همی دشت و گردون به تفت

ز بانگش همی کوه و هامون به کف

5. Yaghmai was not careful in recording words that have contracted forms. In the following lines, the word "ز" (London Museum record) is used instead of the contracted form of "زِ" (Sepahsalar and Majlis record), which distorts the metrical foot:

چو برگشت گرشاسب از آوردگاه

پذیره شدش زود مهراج شاه

6. The editor has added two appendixes at the end of the book. One is *Glossary of Garshasbnameh*, in which sometimes the meanings presented do not correspond to the meanings used in the verse. For example, he mentions the meaning of "حرّم" for the word "پدرام", which is not appropriate for the intended meaning in the following lines:

پدر گفت که «این رای پدرام نیست؛

تو خردی؛ تو را رزم هنگام نیست.»

Here, the meaning of the word is "right".

The other appendix is *Proper Nouns*. Some of the nouns in this list are not proper nouns. For example, the name "خاور" in the lines below:

سوی خاور آید پدید آفتاب

هم آتش کند جوش طوفان چو آب

The word "خاور" in this verse has the opposite meaning of its modern meaning and it means "West" and not "East".

The strength of Yaghmai's edition is the choice of editing methodology. Despite the newly-found manuscripts of *Garshasbnameh*, the best method for editing this work is the multicopy-text and comparative method. The oldest manuscript is incomplete and most of the manuscripts are published later; therefore, they are almost equal in terms of validity and accuracy.

Conclusion

Although Yaghmai is right in terms of choosing the method and selecting the copy-text, the edition is unscientific and inaccurate in execution for the following reasons: a. Not adhering to the editing method; b. Non-regular use of some manuscripts and omission of others from the editing process; c. Irregularity in the preference of the copy-text and textual variants; d. Carelessness in typesetting and lack of effort to edit the text in subsequent publications; e. Not paying attention to nuances of meter; f. Not having critical and explanatory notes where the text is complex due to rhetorical descriptions, philosophical issues, and cultural and historical contexts; g. Some entries in the Glossary either do not match the poet's intended meanings at all or do not include all the author's intended meanings; h. Unexplained and in some cases erroneous list of *Proper Nouns*. Therefore, *Garshasbnamah* needs a critical and methodical edition and comprehensive and scholarly commentaries.

Keywords: Asadi Tousi, *Garshasbnamah*, manuscript, critical edition, commentaries

References

- Asadi Tusi, Abu Nasr Ali Ibn Ahmad (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*. Tehran: National Library of Iran. Reference number 2/11060. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. The date of writing is 1726. [in Persian]
- (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*. Tehran: Islamic Council Library. Reference number 1167. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. The date of writing is 1264. [in Persian]
- (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*. Tehran: Shahid Motahari Higher School Library. Reference number 1562. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. Date of writing: 1455 December 29. [in Persian]
- (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*. Mashhad: Astan Quds Razavi Library. Reference number 4128. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. There is no book date. [in Persian]
- (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*. online England: British Museum Library website. Reference number Or.12985. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. The date of writing is 1573. [in Persian]
- (deceased in 1072). *Garshasbnamah*, Photocopy of the British Museum Library. Tehran: National Library of Iran. Reference number 68-photo. [Manuscript] Authored in 1065. The date of writing is 1393. [in Persian]

- (2010). *Garshasbnameh-ye Asadi Toosi* (Yaqmaei, ed.). Tehran: Donya-ye Ketab. [in Persian]
- Asad Gorgani, F. (2010). *Weis va Ramin*. Tehran: Seda-ye Moaser. [in Persian]
- Dehkhoda, A. A. (1957). *Loghatnameh* (2nd Edition) (under the supervision of Moin and Shahidi). Tehran: University of Tehran. [in Persian]
- Ferdowsi, A. (2000). *Shahnameh*. Tehran: Rafeh Publishing. [in Persian]
- Khaqani, B. (1999). *Diwan-e Khaghani Shervani*. Tehran: Zovvar Publishing. [in Persian]
- Khanlari, P. (2012). *History of Persian language*. Tehran: Now Publication. [in Persian]
- Mayel Haravi, N. (2000). *History of codicology and critical editing of manuscripts*. Tehran: Library, Museum and Documentation Center of the Islamic Council. [in Persian]
- Moin, M. (1998). *Farhang-e Farsi*. Tehran: Amir Kabir Publishing Institute. [in Persian]
- Mowlavi, J. (2011). *Masnavi-e manavi* (R. A. Nicholson, Ed.). Tehran: Hermes Publishing. [in Persian]
- Nasser Khosrow Qabadiani, A. (2009). *Diwan-e Ashare Hakim Nasser Khosrow Qabadiani* (M. Minavi and M. Mohaghegh, Eds.). Tehran: University of Tehran. [in Persian]
- Nizami, E. (1999). *Kollyat-e Nezami Ganjavi*. Tehran: Nagin Publishing. [in Persian]
- Saadi, M. (2000). *Kollyat-e Saadi*. Tehran: Mohammad Publishing. [in Persian]
- Sheikh Tusi, M. (1990). *Al-Gheibat*. Qom: Dar al-Maarif al-Islamiya. [in Arabic]
- Siyuti, J. (1983). *Ad-dorr-ol Manthur fi t-Tafseer Bel-Mathur*. Qom: School of Ayatollah al-Marashi al-Najafi. [in Arabic]